

Terms of Reference:

Hiring of Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation For the Health and Nutrition Conditional Cash Transfer Programme –in Tharparkar and Umarkot districts of Sindh Province

1. Introduction

Government of Sindh under its Sindh Enhancing Response for Reduction of Stunting Project, aims to contribute to a significant improvement in nutrition in the province, by increasing and expanding coverage of multi-sectoral interventions. It comprises objectives and expected outcomes related to the underlying causes (by sectors) of stunting: health, population, sanitation and hygiene, agriculture, social protection and education.

A pilot nutrition-focused Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) programme in targeted districts and is being led by the newly-established Social Protection Strategy Unity (SPSU) in the Chief Minister's Secretariat. The pilot aims to increase the uptake of existing health and nutrition services focused on the first 1000 days of life including ante-natal check-ups, safe deliveries, post-natal care, growth monitoring and immunization of children through the provision of a regular and predictable cash transfer at various trigger points. The pilot will help to develop the nascent capacity of the SPSU and offer lessons for scaling up. Key mandates and functions of the SPSU include project design, social protection operations such as social mobilization, communication, enrolment, compliance verification, payment, and grievance redress through the provincial Social Registry, as well as monitoring, evaluation and lesson-learning and planning for scaling up.

2. Back-ground

Pakistan presents a dismal scenario with respect to health and nutrition statistics. According to the National Nutrition Survey 2011, more than 29.7 per cent of children under-5 are underweight for their age, 43.7 per cent are affected by stunting and around 15.1 per cent by wasting. In addition, 62.1 per cent of children and 26.1 per cent of pregnant women have anemia. Pakistan is at the brink of witnessing the double burden of under nutrition and declining reproductive health of women. Sindh, which is home to more than 50 million people in Pakistan, holds the key in the achievement of health-related SDGs. However, despite ongoing efforts, the health sector performance and pace of change in Sindh is slow and uneven, particularly with respect to maternal, newborn and child health (MNCH) outcomes. The infant mortality rate in Sindh is 74 per 1000 live births, representing only a modest improvement over its rate of 81 deaths per 1000 live births in 1991-92¹. Sindh's child mortality rate at 20 deaths per 1000 children is higher than the national average and greater than that of other provinces like KPK with a child mortality rate of 13 deaths

¹ Pakistan Demographic Health Survey (DHS) 2012-13

per 1000 children². Malnutrition has been found to reduce the likelihood that children will be enrolled in school and reduces the learning capacity of those who are enrolled, putting constraints on social, economic and long-term human development, particularly, with respect to marginalized and disadvantaged communities.

These Terms of Reference are for engaging the services of an Operations Review firm to undertake spot checks and process evaluation for the Health and Nutrition Conditional Cash Transfers (CCT) pilot programme, as elaborated below.

3. Purpose of Operations Review

Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation for the Health and Nutrition Conditional Cash Transfers Pilot Programme will play a strategic role in keeping the SPSU regularly updated about all related processes and implementation mechanisms of the pilot programme from its inception to closure. The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will help in assessing the performance and smooth functioning of the programme by monitoring the efficiency (resource/time wise) and accuracy (adherence to the operational manual) of all stages in the programme cycle, both quantitatively (through Spot Checks) and qualitatively (through Process Evaluation).

The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will comprise of two main methods, as described below:

- i. *Spot Checks:* Primary objective of spot checks is to validate the accuracy of the information collected by the programme with respect to implementation of enrolment, compliance verification, payment and grievances redressal mechanisms. This would include, but not limited to, observing and reporting any variations in the information and determining the causes of such variation, leading to effective feedback for regularly improving the implementation processes.
- ii. *Process Evaluation:* Process evaluation will enable the SPSU to assess the performance of project cycle and process flows by observing the efficiency (resource and time wise) and accuracy (adherence to the Operations Manual). It will measure effectiveness of the programme viz-a-viz target group, enrolment process, compliance verification, regularity and reliability of payments to beneficiaries, effectiveness of grievance mechanism, awareness about the programme processes among beneficiaries and communities. This will facilitate identification of any operational challenges and processes that need revision, improvements, adjustments and correction in a timely manner.

4. Objective of the Assignment

The main objective of this assignment is to conduct appropriate assessment of all processes and mechanisms through a well-placed Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation system. Spot checks and process evaluation during implementation will be integral part of the pilot

² Sindh Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) 2014

programme and would be used to provide regular, timely and reliable quantitative and qualitative feedback to the SPSU on the efficiency and effectiveness of the programme processes and recommend, where necessary, corrective measures to improve the programme design and implementation mechanisms during the assignment period.

5. Scope of Assignment and Responsibilities of the Firm

The selected Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation firm would need to develop a comprehensive understanding of the programme by referring to the Operations Manual and through discussions and meetings with SPSU team. The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will primarily cover the following areas:

- i. **Communication Design/Process, Beneficiary Out-reach and Social Mobilization:** This will include, among others, assessing the capacity of the staff/entities/firms involved in the related design and implementation processes (which should adhere to the operations manual), actual implementation of the functions and material to be used for communication design/process, beneficiary outreach and Social Mobilization. The firm will analyse the processes and highlight critical findings, any gaps and areas of improvement with recommendations on corrective measures.
- ii. **Enrolment Process:** This would include review/assessment of the enrolment process, staff involved in conducting enrolment, logistics arrangements, timelines, M&E setup, MIS application, beneficiaries easiness to enrol in the programme, impact of birth certificates, and recording safe births etc. The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will also look at the take up rate of services offered by the programme and reasons in case of low take up. Further, the actual implementation will be assessed by comparing it with the procedure laid down in the operations manual, suggesting corrective measures in case of deviation and ensuring accuracy of information.
- iii. **Conditions and Verification of Compliance Process:** The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will assess if the operational process is followed correctly and the information reported about the health, immunization, screening and counselling of pregnant women and lactating mothers is accurate and as per the policy guidelines. The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will be done by collecting information through a questionnaire administered to women beneficiaries, focusing on the following aspects:
 - a. Child Health/Immunization Cards and Women Health Cards are available with the beneficiary women and are updated after completing each action/condition/immunization/visit.
 - b. Collecting information from health cards about compliance matching/comparing it with the compliance reports available in MIS.
 - c. Collecting observations/reasons from various sources to see if there are any deviations from operations manual and suggest corrective measures, if needed.

- iv. **Payment Process: Monitoring and Evaluation,** spot checks and process evaluation will look at every aspect of the payment process including, but not limited to, payment process design, selection of PSP, inter-agency funds flow, location and adequacy of payment agents designated by PSP, payment grievances (types of grievances, procedure for lodging grievance, time taken for resolution etc.), payment cycle, payment quarters, MIS, record keeping, lists' generation, disbursement, reconciliation, errors/malpractices by PSP or their designated payment agents with reasons, outputs, and feedback mechanism etc. The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will verify the receipt of actual payment by selected beneficiary women and will compare with the entitlement of each woman in the programme. Further spot checks and process evaluation will assess the process, timeliness of payment delivery, issues related to the travel cost, ease of accessing payment system, transparency and accountability of the payment services. This will be done through a questionnaire administered to the beneficiary women to evaluate the receipt of correct amount and satisfaction with payment agency service when the women exit from the payment agency after collecting payment. A questionnaire would also be administered to the payment point agents covering the related payment process etc.
- v. **Grievances Redressal Mechanism:** The review will cover all the aspects of CCT program's grievances redressal mechanism including types of cases, data updates, case registration, case resolution, timelines, delays and challenges etc. This will also cover the assessment of the whole process, including natures of cases mentioned in the operations manual.
- vi. **Management, Overall Operations and Quality Controls:** This part of the Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation will look at the overall management, operations and quality control mechanisms set up by SPSU and all relevant stakeholders, particularly the relationship, productivity issues and challenges. The firm will suggest corrective measures to improve the overall operations and ensure quality control.

6. Design and Methodology of Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation:

Bidding firms are expected to propose design of the Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation to cover both aspects: spot checks and process evaluation. The Consultant is also required to suggest methodology (including sample size). The selected firm would need to develop the instrument(s) to be used and training curriculum for the field staff, based on the approved design and methodology. Following is the suggested sample for the financial proposal per district. The firm must mention pro rata rates accordingly.

For the beneficiary (Household/Women) surveys, the sample should be representative in characteristics. The proposal should elaborate how the firm will draw the sampling to cover both spot-checks and process evaluation. The proposal should also include any alternate suggestions to improve/adjust the sampling if required. The numbers will be reviewed and agreed upon during the negotiation stage.

7. Reporting:

The selected firm will work closely with Social Protection Strategy Unit (SPSU) throughout the consultancy and will report to the Project Director. Moreover, the selected firm is expected to be in continuous dialogue with SPSU on design and implementation of operations review work. A simple monthly progress report should be submitted by the firm during assignment period; however during the data collection exercise, a fortnightly report is strongly recommended to be submitted to the SPSU having data collection progress, challenges and way forward etc. These reports need to be very short and only contain key information and data.

8. Confidentiality and Data ownership:

The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation survey instruments, the sampling, and the information gathered by the field workers cannot be used for personal or professional gains by the firm, firm's project management team or field workers without the prior request and an approval by SPSU. The ownership of the data belongs to SPSU. The raw and cleaned data should be available immediately after the data is collected. Any delay in this matter might affect the payments to the firm.

9. Expected Outputs:

The expected outputs of this assignment are given as follows:

i. Inception Report:

At the beginning of the assignment, the firm is expected to prepare an inception report outlining the work to be undertaken under the consultancy for both aspects of the Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation i.e. spotchecks and process evaluation. This will include:

- A detailed work plan with estimated time frame, roles and responsibilities of the team.
- Final proposed design, sampling framework and survey instruments and tools.
- Table of contents for the six monthly, Annual and final consolidated report

ii. Periodic Reports on Monitoring and Evaluation, (Spot Checks and Process Evaluation):

- During the assignment period, the firm is expected to provide the following periodic reports and is required to present the operation process, findings and recommendations in a power point presentation to SPSU and other stakeholders. SPSU and stakeholders will review the reports and provide feedback; the firm will be required to incorporate the feedback and submit the revised reports for the approval of SPSU.
 - a. Simple monthly report with summary of key information and data (during data collection fortnightly reports would be required).

- b. Regular six monthly Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation reports need to be submitted. The reports shall cover all the activities performed with comprehensive data analysis (quantitative and qualitative), findings and recommendations for any improvement of the Programme.
 - c. Annual report to be submitted at the completion of a year. The report shall cover all the activities performed by various firms during the year with comprehensive data analysis (quantitative and qualitative), findings and recommendations for any improvement of the Programme.
 - d. The final consolidated review report covering assigned services has to be comprehensive in all respects and submitted within the duration of contract.
- All the four types of reports (monthly/fortnightly, six monthly, annual and final review reports) must include beneficiary satisfaction indicators. An index will be agreed upon at the start of the assignment, which will give the degree of beneficiaries satisfied with the programme implementation, covering complete programme cycle of base and co-responsibility cash transfers.

10. Required Qualifications and Experience:

10.1 The firm shall possess the following qualifications and experience:

- Experience in conducting large scale surveys, including but not limited to, spot checks and process evaluation, on Personal Digital Assistants (PDAs)/Computer Aided Personal Interviews (CAPI).
- Experience in poverty survey work and spot checks, process evaluation and impact evaluation conducted on cash transfers would be given preference.
- Proven ability to work with local partners, authorities and communities

10.2 Key Staff Requirements:

Team Leader and Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation Expert: The Team Leader and OR Expert will provide technical leadership on OR design, methodology and analysis, as well as overall management of the operations review assignment. S/he should preferably possess PhD in relevant field, such as Economics or any related discipline, minimum 10 years of experience in operations and impact assessments with at least 5 years in designing and implementing quantitative and qualitative surveys for cash transfer programmes.

- i. **Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation Coordinator:** The Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation Coordinator will manage the day to day activities related to the design of the Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation, data collection and analysis in the social sector. S/he must possess Master's degree in relevant field such as Economics or Statistics. S/he should have at least 7 years of experience in managing and designing field work, data collection for empirical

and qualitative research with focus on research protocols, research papers and descriptive reports for diverse audience.

- ii. **Data Analysis Expert:** The Data Analysis Expert would be responsible for helping the Team Leader/ Monitoring and Evaluation, spot checks and process evaluation Expert to complete the analysis of the spotchecks and process evaluation data/interviews in a timely manner. S/he must have at least Master's degree in Economics, MIS/IT or any other relevant field with minimum 7 years of experience of Data analysis.
- iii. **Enumeration and Data Quality Expert:** The Enumeration and Data Quality Expert will be responsible to ensure sufficient quality of data by providing input in designing, adapting and pre-testing of instruments, development and execution of training programs and direct supervision of data collection and coordination with Data Manager on data management. S/he must have Masters in Statistics or relevant field with at least 5 years of experience in managing enumeration and ensuring data quality for various survey assignments.
- iv. **Data Manager:** The Data Manager will be responsible for electronic data collection staff training and data management under close supervision of Enumeration and Data Quality Expert. S/he will be responsible for: (a) designing data collection (Computer Aided Personal Interview) application and protocols; (b) designing and leading training for data collection staff; (c) managing data receipts process; (d) making periodic reports about data quality (e.g., error rates, missing data); (e) managing data cleaning process; and (f) delivering the final database. S/he must have: a Bachelor's degree in relevant field (Information Technology, Engineering, Statistics, Economics, etc.); knowledge of CSPro , STATA and other related applications; and at least 3 years of experience in designing and programming data entry templates for household surveys and in overseeing data entry work.

10.3 Estimated Number of Data Collection Staff:

Field and Logistics Manager	01
Enumerators/ Data Collectors	20
Field Supervisors	04

11. Time Frame:

The total assignment period is for 9 months starting with the date when project activities start which is subject to extension depending upon the life of the project. However, the cost for extended shall be finalized in due course. It is expected that these activities would start within the current fiscal year i.e. by 15th April-2021 at the latest. The duration of the contract may be extended on satisfactory performance and at the sole discretion of the client (SPSU of the Govt of Sindh).

12. Tentative Schedule of Delivery and Payment:

S. No.	Expected Outputs	Schedule of Delivery	Payment (Percent of Total Budget)
1.	Inception Report	20 days after of Contract.	10%
2.	1 st quarterly Monthly Operations Review Report	3 months after signing of Contract.	25%
3.	2 nd quarterly Monthly Operations Review Report	6 months after signing of Contract.	15%
4.	1 st Six Monthly Operations Review Report	6 months after signing of Contract.	20%
5.	3 rd quarterly Monthly Operations Review Report	9 months after signing of Contract.	15%
6.	Final Review Report	9 months after signing.	15%